Monitoring Report

Visit Date	03-03-2016
Report Submitted	17-05-2016

- 1). Name of Project: <u>Development of Dheerkot Tourist Resort</u>
- 2). Sector: <u>Tourism</u>
- 3). Sub-Sector: <u>Tourism</u>
- **4). Unique Ref. No:** <u>Tou-103</u>
- 5). Location: <u>District Bagh</u>

District	Tehsil	Constituency	Village/Town Committee
Bagh	Dheerkot		

6). Status:

On-C	Completed	
Original		No

7). (a) Timeline:

	As per PC	2-I	Approved Duration of Project (Months)	As per Admin Approval		
Actual	Date of Approval	Date of Completion		Start Date	Completion Date	
	15-07-2007	10-09-2010	38 Months	11-09-2007	10-09-2010	
Revised (last)						

(b) Time Overrun:

Yes

8). Cost:

Amount	Actual	1 st Revised	2nd Revised
Amount	57.000		
Date	11-09-2007		

(9). Financial Progress:

			Cumulative	Expenditure	During Current	Financial Year
S#	Activities as per PC-I	Approved Cost as per PC-I	Exp. up to the last financial year	Allocation	Releases	Utilization
1	2	3	4	5	6	7
1	Civil Work	46.00	40.496	6.332		
2	Machinery & Other Equipment	4.495	5.309			
3	Furniture & Fixture	1.350	3.378			
4	Pay & Allowances	1.165				
5	Contingencies	2.277				
6	Departmental Supervision charges etc.	1.750	1.495			
	Total	57.037	50.678			

10). Physical Progress: (Quantitative)

			Cumulative Physical	Physical Target Achieved During Current Financial Year	
Activities of Work	Unit	nit Quantity	Achievement up to end of last financial year.	Planned	Achieved
1	2	3	4	5	6
Civil Work Construction of Tourist Lodge (10 bedrooms) at Dheerkot		1	0	1	70% (Work in progress)
Construction of Tourist Huts (2 Nos.) at Dheerkot	No.	2	1	-	Only one hut
Construction of Dormitory at Dheerkot	110.	1	1	-	
Construction of Cafeteria Building at Dheerkot		1	1	-	
Establishment of a small Museum at Neela Butt		1	0	1	Work in progress

Development of View		1	0	-	
Point at Neela Butt		1	Ū		
Construction of Hiking					
Trek between Dheerkot &	KMs	2	2	-	
Neela Butt					
Construction of Link					
roads / Parking lots for	Rft	657	600	57	57
above buildings					
Provision of external		2	2	-	
water supply transmission	No.	_			
Provision of external		2	2	-	
electrification		-	-		
Provision for					
compensation of land at	Kanal	20	0	-	
Dheerkot & Neela Butt					
Consultancy/Supervision/			-	-	
architectural designs					
Architectural Designs		1	1	-	
through CDO	Job		1		
Supervision service	200	1	1	_	
charges by PWD		1	1		

11). Supervision of Work:

Name of PD /Responsible officer	Qazi Saleem
Designation	SDO
Full time/Additional Charge	Full time
Contacts	
Office	05823-920073
Cell	0345-5561047
Fax	

12) Findings

A) Completed buildings/works.

i. At site work of following activities found completed and handed over to the Tourism department in year 2013 with slight variation in cost and physical scope. A detail account containing approved estimates, work order amount and expenditure made is as under:

S#	Item / Activity	Approved	Work order	Expenditure made
1.	Cafeteria	4.700	3.697	3.713
2.	Construction of Tourist Hut (2 Nos.)	3.700	1.920	2.150
3.	Construction of Dormintory	2.100	1.964	2.115
4.	Parking lot	2.500	Not provided	5.733

- Though all above buildings were found completed and are un-utilized for last three years.
 Furthermore, the furniture / fixture and crockery for the above buildings has been purchased but dumped in cafeteria building instead of using for the envisaged purposes.
- iii. It is strange that furniture / fixture and crockery for motel building which is still under construction was also purchased four years ago i.e., in 2012 and dumped in store since then.

B) <u>Work in Progress</u>

1. The construction work of the following buildings is still in progress with slow pace and escalated cost. Detail of progress is summarized below:

Activity	Approved Estimate in PC-1	Work Order Amount.	Exp. Ending 06-2015	Physical Progress at Site.
Construction of tourism motel (10 rooms)	12.220	9.812+ 7.460	13.665	60%
Small museum at Neela butt.	4.200	7.456	5.311	40%

C) <u>Work not started yet.</u>

- i. In PC-1 two huts were to be completed but only one hut was completed whereas work on 2^{nd} hut has yet not been started.
- ii. An amount of Rs.5.00 million was allocated as land compensation. No expenditure was made up till now.

13). Unauthorized / excess payment against following items were made:

S #	Item / work done	Provision	Expenditure	Remarks.
1.	Furniture / fixture for motel and tourist huts (2 Nos.)	1.350	3.378	Excess payment made
2.	Machinery & equipment like hi-ace, van, T.V, freezer, room refrigerator etc.	4.495	5.309	and purchased material is dumped in store.

D) Technical aspects.

- i. There was provision of Rs.2.500 million in PC-I for construction of parking lot & link road, expenditure of Rs.5.733 million has been done which is 129% higher than approved cost. Only PCC pavement for the parking lot is done.
- There was provision of Rs.2.00 million in PC-I for 2 Km hiking tracks between Dhirkot & Neela Butt, approximately 1.5 Km track completed against expenditure of Rs.2.699 million as reflected in APO and track acts as pathway for Forest Department residency and not for park as it has not connected Neela Butt to the Rest House.
- iii. In external electrification, only one transformer & two street light poles were erected, work is still pending facing inordinate delays.
- iv. As per provision of PC-I, Rs.3.200 million were allocated for separate water storage reservoir of Motel, Cafeteria, Dormitory and huts but only one main water tank was constructed in Rs.1.203 million which deviates the ground reality from provision of PC-I.



Side view of motel

The outlined portion shows maroonish texture which indicates the use of sub-standard sand with considerable %age of clays which is not recommended



Use of substandard bricks was observed

No ringing sound was observed on field analysis, reddish color indicating grade-C brick usage in the construction.



Due to dampness damage done to the walls of cafeteria building which indicates poor type of construction, indicating Alkali-silica reaction too as salts are precipated on surface.



Damaged wall of the water storage tank due to poor construction. Use of very sub-standard material de-sedimentation needed



Poor Alignment of window



Access road is damaged due to poor water Management, x-drainage and culvert or causeway needed





Damaged fiber glass canopy even before the execution of project



Water Geezers of dormitory are missing, open manhole and broken pipe indicates poor construction, management and look after of the project. Dampness also observed.



Neela Butt Small Museum





Front View

Side View

Sub-standard bricks with bloating observed, no strength was found upon filed analyis.





Example of Poor brick work. Sagging & honey combing observed due to poor finishing.





Use of substandard bricks was observed. Poor finishing, massive honey combing, sagging and exposed steel in beams were observed.





14). Recommendations/ required action to be taken by the Department.

- 1. The completed building is unused for more than 3 years it should immediately be used for stipulated purposes.
- 2. The remaining work on incomplete activities be expedited forthwith a target to complete the facilities by the end of CFY 2015-16.
- 3. Appropriate enquiry should be held to ascertain regarding the expenditure over and above the PC-1 provision.
- 4. Prior to completion of building, purchase of equipment, furniture and utensil also need justification along with enquiry for dumping it for four years.
- 5. While implementing the project activities timeline, budget provision, scope of project were totally ignored. Therefore it is desired to investigate the causal behavior in implementing the project.
- 6. Airing of the damaged particulars as mentioned in the findings should be done at the cost of contractor.
- 7. Honey combing and dampness should be controlled by using proper engineering techniques.
- 8. The executing department should be asked about the deviation of Tourist huts construction. There was provision of 2 tourist huts in PC-I, only 1 has been constructed so far.
- 9. The project was approved for a period of three years but unfortunately project has not been only delayed but also financial liability against contingency charges occurred which is spread over a period of six years.
- 10. Use of local sandstone as aggregate was observed at the site which indicates non follow up of engineering perspectives.
- 11. The executing department should accelerate the remaining work of Motel & Neela Butt Museum.
- 12. The technical staff should regularly monitor all the activities to avoid use of sub-standard material and poor quality work.

13. Generally, the Department should hold enquiry for deviation in approved vs completed works viz-a-viz incurring of expenditures of different items over and above the approved cost and report to the P&DD.

15) Category: (Please mark one as per the findings/recommendations).

Activities as per PC-I	Very Good	Good	Satisfactory	Poor

16). Reporting team (P&D)

Name	Designation	Signature	Date
Raja Manzoor Hussain	Chief (M&E)		
Engr. Ahtesham Altaf	Assistant Director (M&E)		
Syed Ahmed Hassan	Geologist (RA)		